

4. COMPARATIVE INTERPRETATIVE ANALYSIS - RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN FORMAL AND INFORMAL IN MUSICAL - INSTRUMENTAL EDUCATION; A MODEL OF COMPARATIVE PARALLEL: "CHACONNE" FOR SOLO VIOLIN BY JOHANN SEBASTIAN BACH IN THE VERSIONS OF THE VIOLINISTS JASCHA HEIFETZ AND AUGUSTIN HADELICH

Alina Stanciu¹²

Abstract: *In instrumental education, the correlation between formal and informal education by means of comparative interpretive analysis is necessary both in the development of the instrumentalist's personality and in the acquisition of a musical experience appropriate to the complex performer. This paper proposes to violin students, a comparative parallel model of the "Chaconne" for solo violin by Johann Sebastian Bach in two reference versions. Developed according to an analytical matrix whose guiding milestones are objectively flexible, the analytical approach is based on the interpenetration of formal and informal.*

Key words: *Formal education, Informal education, Comparative parallel, "Chaconne", Analytical matrix*

1. Introduction

Correlation between formal and informal education by means of musical audition and the comparison of various interpretive versions is a particularity of instrumental education. The theoretical and practical acquisitions, the skills accumulated in the systematized framework offered by the instrumental course are imperatively required to be completed by the student's personal documentation, the use of internet resources, audio-visual materials, all the more so since the emerging world is a predominantly visual one and electronics.

The autonomous acquisition of the future performer and pedagogue in the instrument acquired through musical audition has a spontaneous character, often looking for different interpretive versions of the musical work studied in class or of other works at random. Although independent auditory documentation cannot be the fundamental basis of one's own instrumental and interpretive training, it undoubtedly contributes to the completion of the student's culture and musical experience - future performer. Used judiciously, the elements of informal culture serve substantially to develop one's own interpretive personality.

Taking the idea of the pedagogue Constantin Cucuș¹³, according to which formal education represents more "an introduction to the sphere of culture and initial preparation for permanent education", we specify that the purpose of instrumental education is the musician-performer, with his own destiny and artistic personality, helped to create himself, able to conquer independently in the wide world of soloism or instrumental pedagogy. So, the harmonious interweaving of formal and informal in interpretative education is not only necessary, but also inevitable.

¹² Associate Professor PhD., "Gheorghe Dima" National Academy of Music, Cluj - Napoca, România, email: daniel_stanciu_email@yahoo.com

¹³ Cucuș, Constantin, 1998, "Psihopedagogie pentru examenul de definitivare și grade didactice", Editura Polirom, Iași

2. Analytical approach

Regarding the effective comparative analysis, among the many recordings available, I opted for the version of the "Chaconne" in two reference interpretative versions, from the past and current, wanting to capture particularities of the expressive means of instrumental rendering from different periods: the first half of the century XX – through the interpretation of the violinist Jascha Heifetz and the current violin landscape: Augustin Hadelich. Since Bach's "Sonatas and Partitas for solo violin" can be found in several editions, I have considered it necessary to present some of the most used, following the way in which the original manuscript is respected.

For the first time, the supposed original text and published only in 1950, 200 years after the death of the composer Bärenreiter – Verlag, was proposed to violinists by Joseph Joachim and Andreas Moser in the version edited by Bote and Bote in Berlin in 1909. Printing of the text was made on two staves: the first with its own technical and phrasing indications, the second staff representing the "Ur-text"¹⁴. Another used edition belongs to Karl Flesch¹⁵. His edition also reproduces in the second part the original text, in the first part the author proposes personal solutions.

Other editions currently in use that reproduce the text - manuscript are those published in: "Muzika" Moscow Publishing House, 1968 and 1985, revised by Konstantin Mostras, Polish Musical Publishing House, 1970, revised by Tadeus Wronsky, as well as that of Ivan Galamian, published in New York - International Music Co, in 1971. "The existence of such an informative material, imposed and still imposes, a comparative research of the editions, following on the one hand, the confrontation of the revisions with the original manuscript, and on the other hand, the similarities and differences between them, viewed from the point of view vision of violin performance and interpretation."¹⁶ Most of the current interpretive conceptions are guided by the principle of respecting the original text as faithfully as possible, certain interventions being mainly due to technical execution needs.

3. Historical

Jascha Heifetz – biographical reference data

He was one of the greatest violin virtuosos of all time. Due to his amazing technical dexterity, many of his contemporaries considered him the "king of violinists". He was born in Russia in Vilnius on February 2, 1899. At the age of only two, he was initiated into the study of the violin by his father, an acclaimed musician. He continues his violin lessons under the guidance of Professor Ilya Markin at the Music School in his hometown. At the age of six, he made his public debut, performing the concerto in E minor by Mendelsohn. In 1910 he was accepted to the Sankt Peterburg Conservatory, the class of the renowned pedagogue Leopold Auer, on whose recommendation he went to Berlin, Hochschule für Musik in 1912. After the audition, he was hired to perform the Tchaikovsky concerto with the Berlin

¹⁴ Szering, Henryk, 1981, "Sonaten und Partiten für violine solo", E.D. 6850, C. B. Schot's Sohne, Mainz, p. 83

¹⁵ Flesch, Karl, 1930, "J. S. Bach, "Sonaten und Partiten für violine solo", Neue Ausgabe von Karl Flesch, Ed. Peters, Leipzig

¹⁶ Nicolae, Victoria, 1987, "Contribuții la o cercetare comparativă a celor mai utilizate ediții ale sonatelor și partitelor pentru vioară solo de J. S. Bach", Academia de Muzică "Gheorghe Dima", Cluj – Napoca, dactilografiat, p. 2

Philharmonic, at only thirteen years old. The year 1921 represents for the young Heifetz his debut at Carnegie Hall, exciting both the public and the press. He acquired American citizenship in 1925 and settled in Beverly Hills, California. He undertakes numerous tours in all the great cultural-artistic centers of the world. From 1974, he stopped his career as a soloist, but continued his stage activity in the exceptional chamber trio: Heifetz Articolul 3 Piatigorski – Pennario. At the same time, he teaches master classes at the University of Southern in Los Angeles (1962 – 1972). He died in 1987.¹⁷

Augustin Hadelich - biographical reference data

Born on April 4, 1984, Cecina Toscana in Italy, Augustin Hadelich is a renowned Italian-German-American classical violinist, winner of a "Grammy" award. At only five years old, he began studying the violin with his father, a farmer and amateur cellist. Hadelich progressed his studies through irregular lessons and master classes from violinists traveling to Tuscany, including Uto Ughi, Cristoph Poppen, Igor Ozim and others, enjoying a flourishing career as a violinist, pianist and composer in Germany. In 1999, after his recovery from an accident, Hadelich graduated "Summa cum laude" from the "Istituto Mascagni" in Livorno, Italy and was admitted to the "Juillard school".

In 2005 he obtained his bachelor's degree, and in 2007, his artist's degree. After graduation, he settled in New York, becoming an American citizen in 2014. After winning the first prize at the Indianapolis International Violin Competition (2006), Hadelich proved himself ready for the world stage, performing with the most famous orchestras. In 2016, Hadelich won a Grammy Award for "Best Classical Instrumental Solo" at the 58th Grammy Awards in Los Angeles. In 2019 he was named artist in association with the NDR Elb Philharmonie Orchestra in Hamburg, a title he holds until 2023. He also became the inaugural winner of the Warner Music Prize, which includes a recording opportunity with Warner Classics. Hadelich was invited for master classes at the Yale School of Music. The artist had the opportunity to perform with some of the famous Stradivarius violins: the "Ex-Gingold" 1683, the "Kiesewerter Stradivarius" 1723 and the "Leduc - Szeryng" Guarneri del Gesu 1744, a violin he still owns today.¹⁸

4. Analytical comparative parallel of the "Chaconne" from Part II, B.M.W. 1004 in D minor for solo violin by J.S. Bach in interpretative versions: Jascha Heifetz – Augusti Hadelich (excerpts)

The analytical approach is guided by a matrix whose milestones we designed flexibly, their order being objectively variable. They relate to the moment when they impose themselves on the attention during the musical performance. We will follow: tempo (range of tempos); elements of character; agogic elements; particularities of intonation, with references to melodic, harmonic, polyphonic intonation; elements of dynamics, dynamic dosage; means of expression of instrumental rendering.

Jascha Heifetz version

The tempo adopted by Heifetz falls within the scale of M.M. quarter 55 – 60,

¹⁷ Stanciu, Alina, 2005, "Violonistica enesciană ca expresie a unei stilistici interpretative", Editura Media Musica, Cluj – Napoca, p. 20

¹⁸ Wikipedia.org

having a unitary character, the fluctuations between variations being minimal. It should be noted that Heifetz, a renowned virtuoso, advocates high tempos in his interpretations. Although the fluidity of the movement within the musical performance is an interpretive particularity of the violinist, the initial tempo of the Chaconne is substantially accelerated only during the improvisational variations: VII a, VII b, VIII a, VIII b, XI, of the variational group XII - XVI within the first thematic block, variations XXX, XXXV a, Thematic Block III.

The character is solemn. In the musical discourse, agogic and dynamic inflections are used related to the character of the variations, the palette of nuances with a wide spectrum, between "fortissimo" and "pianissimo". In the beginning of the Chaconne, Heifetz attributes a sustained, solemn character to the theme. The bow is resumed on each chord, with its repetition and on the octave value. The way of arpeggiating the chords is done in the manner of two plus two voices, emphasizing the descending march of the bass (the ostinato plan) with the specific rhythm. Bow changes are made with a slight, natural articulation, resulting from changes in direction or its resummptions. The melodic and harmonic intonation are correct, the sound is ample. The dense and sustained vibrato expresses every chord of the theme.

Ex. no. 1 Theme:



Variation I:

- The tempo remains constant;
- The chords are performed with arpeggios in the manner of two plus two voices, inverted towards the middle voice (the relief of the melodic line is desired). We mention that in current interpretations of Bach's Solo Sonatas and Partitas, inverted chords are no longer common, opting for arpeggiated chords from the bass to the treble, or plated chords (the elements of the chord are performed simultaneously, with the tension of the bow towards the required voice highlighted);
- The performer opts for the "legato" version, marking sixteenths with the right hand. The last sixteenth value on the second half of time three in each measure is articulated separately, giving the musical speech a cursive, quasi-dancing character;
- The sonority is broad, homogeneous, in the "mezzoforte" to "forte" shade;
- Each note is expressed through vibrato.

Ex. no. 2



Variation II:

- The tempo is constant;

- The character is italic;
- The vibrato intensifies, in combination with the expressive "tenuto" from the right hand;
- The sonority becomes velvety, by reducing the bow pressure and increasing its speed;
- After stating the theme in the "forte" tone, a dynamic "gradation" is noticeable: (forte – mezzoforte – piano).

Ex. no. 3



Next, we will present the variation group XII - XVII, "arpeggio" whose technical solution was achieved by the interpreters in the most varied ways, Bach notating the text in chords. However, he indicates, in the beginning of the variation group, an arpeggio in quartets of thirty-seconds, but many interpreters opt for other variants. In his interpretation, Heifetz pleads for timbral and sound homogeneity within the chords, thus justifying the approach of double strings within this variation group. We specify that in some editions of the Bachian sonatas, some violinists, such as Karl Flesch, attach great importance to aesthetic imperatives. He opts for complicated technical solutions, which favor timbral unity¹⁹. In interpreting the Chaconne, Heifetz is guided by this principle.

Without insisting on the details of technical realization, we only mention the different ways of combining the "legato" throughout the musical discourse: two plus two linked manner within the thirty-second quartets (indicated by Bach in the beginning of the fifteenth variation), alternated with thirty-second sextlets. Returning to the initial manner of execution, in the beginning of the XVI variation, the performer marks the moment of culmination of this variation group. In the descending sequence from measures 113 - 120, the melodic line of the bass is revealed more by "tenuto", than the "passus durisculus" found in the treble of the same measures. According to the analytical matrix:

- The tempo of the variation group is accelerated;
- The character is grandiose (through the full execution in double strings);
- The melodic intonation is just;
- Harmonic intonation is slightly unclear before the climax;
- The sound is ample;
- Chords are supported by vibrato.

The last variation of this group, a moment of "stretto"²⁰, is executed with a meaningful and agile articulation of the left hand under legato. The descending line of the bass is highlighted by the dense "tenuto" and "vibrato". During the musical discourse we note:

- The tempo remains alert;
- Improvisational, virtuoso character;

¹⁹ Barbu, Casiu, 1987, "Metodica studiului și predării instrumentelor cu coarde (cu arcuș)", ediția a II-a, Conservatorul de Muzică "Gheorghe Dima", Cluj Napoca, p. 201

²⁰ Timaru, Valentin, 1997, "Compendiu de forme și analize muzicale", Universitatea Transilvania din Brașov, Facultatea de muzică, Brașov, p. 80

- From an agogical point of view, we observe a fall of thirty-seconds below the legato;
- The sonority is ample and homogeneous, with a "strong" tone;
- The technical dexterity of the performer in this variation group is remarkable.

Ex. no. 4



Augustin Hadelich version

The tempo adopted by Hadelich falls within the scale of M.M. fourths 50 – 55, fluctuating between variations with a different musical character, but maintained within them. The formal delimitation of the variations is achieved by decreasing the basic tempo. The character is solemn, almost dancing. Agogic inflections refer to the character of the variations. It uses a diversified dynamic palette, from barely perceptible nuances mastered with instrumental mastery, to impressive sonic extremes. It should be noted that Hadelich plays on a "Stradivarius" model, an opportunity to obtain an impeccable sonority, difficult to achieve in violinist performance.

In the beginning of the Chaconne, Hadelich gives the theme a rhythmic, quasi-dancing character. The bow is repeated on each chord, without repeating it on the octave value. The chords are arpeggiated quickly, in the manner of one plus three voices, highlighting the theme. The octave value on the second half of the third time is articulated meaningfully, with consistency, throughout the theme. The melodic and harmonic intonation are impeccable, the sonority homogeneous and ample. The chords of the theme are supported by a resonant and expressive vibrato.

Variation I:

- The tempo remains constant;
- The chords are sung in a semi-plated manner (technique by means of which the performer achieves an impeccable rendering of the meaningful - rhythmic, dancing character of the musical discourse);
- The sonority is full, homogeneous, in the "mezzoforte" tone;
- The vibrato expresses the melodic line within the middle voice.

Variation II:

- The tempo is slightly decreased;
- The character remains almost - dancing, with a singable note, conferred by the dynamic gradient "mezzoforte - piano";
- The vibrato decreases in intensity, the sonority becomes velvety, by means of the right hand;
- In measure 22, the "pianissimo", taken to the extreme, penetrates through the timbre of the instrument;
- In measure 24, the tone increases towards "mezzopiano" preparing the beginning of the third variation.

Next, we will present the interpretative features of this version, Variation group XIII – XVII.

The debut (variation XV) is performed in an alert tempo, prepared during the preceding variation, demonstrating the virtuosity of the performer. Hadelich follows the original text consistently, arpeggiating the chords in a two plus two bound manner up to measure 102 of the sixteenth variation. The musical discourse continues in the manner of two plus two linked notes, with the difference that the arpeggiation of the chords is done with double strings consistently, up to "stretto". Hadelich does not respect "ad - literam" any of the variants offered by the used editions, the method of execution of the variation group starting from Bach's indication and continuing with his own variant. The performer intends a gradation of the sound amplitude until the culmination in measure 113, which he emphasizes with the "tenuto" associated with the yielding of the basic tempo. According to the analytical matrix we find:

- The character is grandiose;
- Melodic and harmonic intonation are impeccable;
- Sound homogeneity within the chords is full;
- The highlighting of "passus durisculus" is clear;
- The last variation within this group is sung with a prompt articulation of the left hand;
- The descending melodic line from the bass is highlighted by means of the right hand and vibrato, without derogating from the tempo. A slight retention of it is perceptible in the last measure of the "stretto", preparing the resumption of the theme;
- From a dynamic point of view, the musical discourse unfolds between mezzopiano and fortissimo nuances.

5. Conclusions

The main point of the analytical approach is the manner in which the two interpreters respected the original text. From this perspective, Augustin Hadelich's version respects the Bachian "ur - text", the interpreter opting for Konstantin Mostras's edition, one of the most used, precisely because of this fact. In the "arpeggio" variation group, he applies his own specific violinistic solutions but is guided by Bach's indication given at the beginning of the sequence.

Adopting Karl Flesch's edition whose technical solutions are written on the first stave, the second representing the original, Heifetz moves away from Bachian coordinates. The variational group "arpeggio" in the rendering of which the performer intervenes with personal solutions, constitutes a display of his brilliant violinist potential. Although some interpreters considered the master's conception questionable, we take into account the fact that Bach only noted the arpeggio mode of the respective sequence at the beginning, continuing the chordal writing.

The initial tempo adopted by both performers is slightly different, Heifetz opting for a more alert tempo, from which he makes small exceptions in some cases. From this point of view, the Hadelich variant offers a freer conception. Agogica, in the case of both performers, is generated by the intonation of polyphonic elements. The homogenous sonority, efficiency and expressiveness of the vibrato characterize

the two versions. The dynamic palette displayed by Heifetz is more limited, but there is a certain subjectivism due to the technical means of recording, which were not very efficient at the time. Hadelich's interpretation is imposed by a less common timbre, but even in this case there is a subjective note due to the artist's opportunity to handle one of the few examples of Stradivarius. Both versions, however, are known as landmarks in the current violin landscape.

References

1. Barbu, Casiu (1987), *Metodica predării și a studiului instrumentelor cu coarde (cu arcuș)*, ed. II-a, Conservatorul de Muzică „Gh. Dima”, Cluj Napoca
2. Beaujon, M. E. (?), *Histoire du Violon et des grands Violonistes (Traité de Violon)*, Elite Edition nr 548, Leipzig Musikverlag, Leipzig
3. Cucuș, Constantin, (1998), *Psihopedagogie pentru examenul de definitivare și grade didactice*, Editura Polirom, Iași
4. Flesch, Karl, (1930), *J. S. Bach, Sonaten und Partiten für Violine solo, neue Ausgabe von Karl Flesch*, Editura Peters, Leipzig
5. Joachim, Joseph, Moser, Andreas, (1909), *Sonaten und Partiten für Violine solo*, Bote and Bote, Berlin
6. Nicolae, Victoria, (1987), *Contribuții la o cercetare comparativă a celor mai utilizate ediții ale sonatelor și partitelor pentru vioară solo de J. S. Bach*, Academia de muzică Gheorghe Dima, Cluj – Napoca
7. Stanciu, Alina, (2005), *Violonistica enesciană ca expresie a unei stilistici interpretative*, Editura Media Musica, Cluj – Napoca
8. Szering, Henryk, (1981), *Sonaten und Partiten für Violine solo*, E. D. 6850, C. B. Schot's Sohne, Mainz
9. Timaru, Valentin, (1997), *Compendiu de forme și analize muzicale*, Universitatea Transilvania din Brașov, Facultatea de Muzică, Brașov
10. xxx Wikipedia.org